



universität
wien

DISSERTATION / DOCTORAL THESIS

Titel der Dissertation /Title of the Doctoral Thesis

Performing State Boundaries

A Stategraphy of Citizen Participation in China

verfasst von / submitted by

Mag.phil. Christof Lammer, Bakk.phil.

angestrebter akademischer Grad / in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doktor der Philosophie (Dr.phil)

Wien, 2018 / Vienna 2018

Studienkennzahl lt. Studienblatt /
degree programme code as it appears on the student
record sheet:

A 796 310 307

Dissertationsgebiet lt. Studienblatt /
field of study as it appears on the student record sheet:

Kultur- und Sozialanthropologie
Social and Cultural Anthropology

Betreut von / Supervisor:

Univ.-Prof. Dr. Tatjana Thelen, MA

Contents

<i>Detailed contents</i>	<i>ii</i>
Introduction	
The state and its boundaries: performative boundary work	1
<u>Part I: Distancing the entangled state: performances of participation in a food network</u>	45
Chapter 1	
Peasant participation as boundary work:	
performing state and NGO trainings on agriculture in an ecological village	47
Chapter 2	
Consumer participation as boundary work:	
performing transparency, state certification and personal relations in a food network	73
Chapter 3	
Participatory parenting as boundary work:	
performing state and community care for the rural left-behind child	105
<u>Part II: Making policy by distancing the state: performances of participation in bureaucracy</u>	131
Chapter 4	
List-making as boundary work:	
performing community in the democratic appraisal of eligibility for state assistance	133
Chapter 5	
Standardisation as boundary work:	
performing bureaucracy, negotiating stupidity in public reapplications for state assistance	155
Chapter 6	
Filial piety as boundary work:	
negotiating state welfare and workfare with performances of ‘traditional Chinese familism’	181
Conclusion	
Performing state boundaries through participation	205
<i>Bibliography</i>	<i>221</i>

Detailed contents

<i>Tables</i>	<i>vii</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>viii</i>
Introduction	
The state and its boundaries: performative boundary work	1
Situating stategraphy in social science	4
<i>After the origin of the state: an anthropology without the state</i>	5
<i>A wealth of competing state definitions</i>	6
<i>The blurred boundaries of the state</i>	7
<i>After the cultural turn: the new ethnography of the state and its critics</i>	9
Stategraphy and other relational approaches	12
<i>State relations in stategraphy and in neo-Marxism</i>	13
<i>Rejecting state-as-subject and state-as-object formulations</i>	15
<i>Strategic selectivity</i>	16
Bringing performance to stategraphy	17
<i>The boundary problem</i>	18
<i>Boundary work</i>	19
<i>The performance of state boundaries</i>	23
Bringing stategraphy to China	28
<i>The Chinese state: beyond authoritarian, socialist and cultural otherness</i>	28
<i>The case of citizen participation</i>	32
<i>'Welcome to the ecological village': ethnographic fieldwork</i>	36
Overview	40
Part I: Distancing the entangled state: performances of participation in a food network	45
Chapter 1	
Peasant participation as boundary work:	
performing state and NGO trainings on agriculture in an ecological village	47
1.1 Introduction	47
<i>A state official's distancing of the state</i>	48
<i>Bringing stategraphy to Agro-Food Studies</i>	49

1.2	Funding peasant participation in an ecological village	50
	<i>Strategic selectivity in rural governance in China</i>	50
	<i>State support: peasant participants on lists</i>	51
	<i>Consumer support: distancing the ecological from the state's organic certification</i>	53
1.3	Performing the state in the classroom	57
	<i>Recruiting peasants, waiting for the state</i>	57
	<i>A stage for the state</i>	59
	<i>Participation as paid work</i>	60
	<i>Upholding a distance between state and peasant</i>	61
1.4	Performing civil society in the classroom	62
	<i>Recruiting peasants and consumers as civil society</i>	62
	<i>Participation as unpaid commitment</i>	63
	<i>A stage for civil society</i>	64
	<i>Naturalising consumer self and peasant other</i>	66
	<i>The travel of Mao's idea of the mass line</i>	68
1.5	Conclusion: slippery state boundaries: from socialist blurring to liberal sharpening	69
Chapter 2		
	Consumer participation as boundary work: performing transparency, state certification and personal relations in a food network	73
2.1	Introduction	73
	<i>Embeddedness in 'alternative' food networks</i>	74
	<i>Instrumentalist personal relations in deficient (post-)socialisms</i>	75
2.2	Performing transparency through consumer participation	79
	<i>Othring the organic grocery store next door</i>	80
	<i>Three elements of transparency in a consumer association</i>	83
2.3	Staging state certification	86
	<i>Affirming certification in the organic grocery store</i>	87
	<i>Questioning certification in the consumer association's shop</i>	87
	<i>Negotiating certification for the ecological village</i>	88
	<i>Crossing out the state: staging the personal as superior</i>	89
	<i>Mirroring institutions: lacking state certification as transformative potential</i>	90
2.4	Performing the ecological village	92
	<i>Justifying agricultural practices</i>	92
	<i>Preparing the performance of transparency for consumer visits</i>	95
	<i>Giving banquets without the taste of the state</i>	97
	<i>Linking the non-ecological with the state</i>	99
	<i>Defending the vegetable base as a stage for consumer participation</i>	100
2.5	Conclusion: performing a safe distance: 'good' personal relations and 'bad' state institutions	101

Chapter 3

Participatory parenting as boundary work:

performing state and community care for the rural left-behind child

105

3.1 Introduction

105

Liberal family images and the Chinese state's otherness

107

The travel of the idea of participation across the state/family boundary

108

3.2 The construction of the 'Chinese left-behind child'

110

Numbers

110

A new Chinese phenomenon?

111

Worldwide expert language

112

Media reports and state documents

112

3.3 State and society as partners: splitting care responsibility

113

The state's material care for the left-behind child

113

Society's emotional care: compensating the absence of parents and state

115

Community care: activating rural resources

116

'The nation is a family': father state and mother society in China

118

3.4 Performances and artefacts of participatory parenting

120

Performing the difference of state and community education

120

Consumer associations as 'mommies groups'

124

Urban mommies' self-sewn dolls: performing intensive parenting

125

Rural children's drawings: staging the success of community education

126

3.5 Conclusion: upholding the state/family split through participatory parenting

127

Part II: Making policy by distancing the state: performances of participation in bureaucracy **131**

Chapter 4

List-making as boundary work:

performing community in the democratic appraisal of eligibility for state assistance

133

4.1 Introduction

133

Expanding state boundaries: citizen participation in bureaucracy

135

Seeing like a state and being seen through lists

136

4.2 State assistance in China: debating the Minimum Living Guarantee

137

'Rational' and 'critical' approaches: state for society or state versus society

137

The School of Rural Governance: the village as the 'soil' for state policy

139

4.3 Activating relational modalities: pushing the state 'up' and 'out'

140

Community volunteer modality

141

Paternalist modality

143

4.4 The 'logic of not-offending'

145

Questioning neediness and deservingness backstage

146

Untold memories: devaluing open confrontation

147

The abolition of agricultural tax and 'peasant atomisation'

148

Embeddedness in villagers' groups: co-producing state and community

149

4.5 Conclusion: signatures of local belonging: lists as boundary objects

150

Chapter 5

Standardisation as boundary work:

performing bureaucracy, negotiating stupidity in public reapplications for state assistance 155

5.1	Introduction	155
5.2	The standardisation of state assistance in stories and numbers	157
	<i>'Scientific, accurate and just': standardisation in central state documents</i>	157
	<i>A township official's history of the Minimum Living Guarantee in Qiuling Township</i>	159
	<i>Reading state images into statistics: caring or economically unsuccessful</i>	161
	<i>State assistance in local statistics: standardisation as masking social cuts</i>	163
5.3	Talking standardisation: negotiating state standards and 'stupidity'	165
	<i>Rendering policy technical and citizens 'stupid'</i>	166
	<i>'Stupidity' as a safe space: probing bureaucrats' discretionary power</i>	167
5.4	Performing standardisation: bureaucrats and submissive supplicants	170
	<i>Learning to perform as a 'proper' recipient of state assistance</i>	170
	<i>Aid for suffering bodies: performing as submissive supplicant</i>	172
	<i>Overcoming paternalism: performing a distance between citizens and bureaucrats</i>	174
	<i>Making 'standardised' policy locally: discretion and unpredictability</i>	175
5.5	Conclusion: making policy by performing the state as split in government and bureaucracy	177

Chapter 6

Filial piety as boundary work:

negotiating state welfare and workfare with performances of 'traditional Chinese familism' 181

6.1	Introduction	181
	<i>Filial participation in a state meeting: making familial care invisible</i>	182
	<i>Studying traditional familism: beyond Chinese culture and the parasitic state</i>	183
6.2	Ambivalences towards familism in the standardisation of state assistance	187
	<i>Curbing 'human feeling allowances': too much family in the 'wrong' place</i>	187
	<i>Strengthening 'household responsibility': not enough family in the 'right' place</i>	188
	<i>Familism by modern law: enforcing tradition against tradition</i>	189
	<i>Self-reliance in state and NGO discourse: responsible units 'below' the state</i>	190
6.3	Selective uses of familism: making local Minimum Living Guarantee politics	191
	<i>Demanding compensation: state assistance as a means for rural governance</i>	191
	<i>Composing a Minimum Living Allowance household of needy individuals</i>	193
	<i>Local workfare: making family members clean the ecological village</i>	196
	<i>Reshuffling over- and under-implementation: the demise of local workfare</i>	198
6.4	Claiming state assistance with familism	200
	<i>Making claims as a filial son of family and state</i>	200
	<i>The poverty of not having a family</i>	201
6.5	Conclusion: 'tradition' on the 'right' and the 'wrong' side of the state/family boundary	202

Conclusion	
Performing state boundaries through participation	205
Stategraphy: performative boundary work	206
Doing the state by performing civic participation as outside	208
Intermediaries: distancing the entangled state	210
Relating across boundaries: antagonism, competition, complementarity, compatibility	213
State boundaries and sub-disciplinary boundaries	216
Similarity and difference beyond state boundaries	217
<i>Bibliography</i>	221
<i>Abstract</i>	243
<i>Zusammenfassung</i>	244